Part II of Diversity and Tolerance in Colonial America:
Immigrants in Colonial America

Essential Question: Does diversity breed tolerance or intolerance?
Topical Questions: Under what conditions might “tolerance” have prevailed in early colonial America? What makes tolerance possible?

Part II Topic: Immigrants in Colonial America (Note: The Teacher must determine how much time or how many sessions to devote to all of the lessons in these units. We title them “Sessions” in recognition that they may take longer than one period)

Student Learning Objectives for Part II:
• Identify various cultural groups in Colonial America. Use specific information to substantiate a long history of diversity in America.
• Identify essential information about various cultural groups in Colonial America including: why the group came, where the group settled, the contributions of the group, its legacy etc.
• Draw and support conclusions about similarities and differences between the various cultural groups and their experiences in Colonial America.
• Using own words, explain the concept of assimilation and the varying degrees to which various cultural groups in Colonial America assimilated. Similarly explain the varying degrees of tolerance exhibited by the different cultural groups. Provide specific examples. Explain some of the primary reasons for these differences.
• Define immigrant and identify arguments for and against considering enslaved Africans as immigrants.
• Demonstrate and hone cooperative learning skills. Use the consensus process for group decision making. Share research with other students.
• Articulate information, opinions and ideas. Support positions with historical evidence and intellectual reasoning. Demonstrate listening skills by restating a fellow student’s ideas.
• Argue and defend multiple and differing perspectives.
• Articulate the primary reasons that enslaved Africans should be considered immigrants and those reasons that they should not.
SESSION 1: Diversity Case Study: The Dutch in Colonial America

Concepts to be covered in this lesson:

• Identify various cultural groups in Colonial America. Use specific information to substantiate a long history of diversity in America.
• Identify essential information about various cultural groups in Colonial America including: why the group came, where the group settled, the contributions of the group, its legacy, and so on.

Opening: Choose one of the three Exit Slip questions from Part I, Session 3, to discuss:
• Who We Are? Throughout our history, the question of “who we are” as Americans has been asked. If you were living in America in 1765, how would you have answered that question? How would you answer that question today in 2010?
• Identify one way that the diversity in the American Colonies influenced American culture and/or history?
• Did the existence of diversity in the Colonial Period help to make America more or less tolerant and appreciative of cultural differences? Give one reason to support your opinion.

Core Instructional Activities:
1. Distribute the Cultural Diversity in Colonial America (CDICA) worksheet (below). Explain that students will work together to complete this worksheet about the Dutch in Colonial America. Teacher further explains that before that work begins, student groups will be formed with each being assigned two other immigrant groups to research either outside of class or during class time, depending on the class schedule. Each group will have time in class to complete some organizational tasks.

2. Teacher creates six groups of students numbered 1 through 6. Teacher assigns each student group one group from each of the following six immigrant groups and students can select another group (not already assigned): African-Americans; English; French; American Indian—Iroquois; American Indian—Algonquian; Quakers.

3. Every student receives TWO copies of the CDICA worksheet. Before meeting in groups, teacher distributes and reviews To Do Checklist (below) that will be collected at a designated time. After completing the sheets, teacher reconvenes the entire class for the purpose of modeling the assignment—completion of the CDICA—using the case of the Dutch.

4. Before students begin, review: How many have learned about the Dutch in Colonial America? Does anyone know someone of Dutch heritage? What is one thing that you already know about the Dutch in Colonial America?

5. Students who have been deemed responsible for certain questions will form an “Expert” group, e.g. those students answering Question 4 are the Experts for Question #4. (Most students will have responsibility for more than one question. For example, Mary
may be an expert on Question 4 and Question 8). There will be 12 designated meeting places in the classroom for those answering the various 12 questions. These groups are directed to gather information about their particular question/s and then briefly meet to determine the answer regarding the Dutch, i.e. the six students for Question #4 use internet or textual resources to obtain information and report to the designated meeting place. Some groups will have to wait for others before deciding the answer and to select their spokesperson. These Expert spokespersons will report out to the entire class so that everyone has a completed worksheet about the Dutch. Remind students that bibliographical information is required.

Sources:
Video Presentation of Firth Fabend
http://www.newnetherlandinstitute.org/vtour/index.html
http://www.u-s-history.com/pages/h561.html
http://www.coins.nd.edu/ColCoin/ColCoinIntros/Netherlands.html
http://history-world.org/dutch_settlement.htm
http://www.hrm.org/DutchNY/dutchnyexhibition.html
http://www.nnp.org/
http://www.nps.gov/nr/travel/kingston/colonization.htm
http://www.celebrateboston.com/history/period02/p0207newyork.htm

Closure: Exit slip or brief discussion: What does the Dutch experience in America demonstrate about diversity and tolerance during the American Colonial period? How did this group’s presence and experience in America shape our history and culture?
CULTURAL DIVERSITY IN COLONIAL AMERICA

YOUR NAME:  
Number of Group:

1. What was the PRIMARY reason that the group came to America?
   
2. Approximately, how many came before and/or during the American Colonial Period? ____________________________

3. Around 1750-1775, approximately what percentage of the population did this group constitute in America?
   
4. Where did the group primarily live? ____________________________

5. To what degree, was this group INCLUDED or ASSIMILATED in the American Colonial Society? Use 1-10 scale, 10 representing the most included or assimilated. What demonstrates this and what is one explanation for it?
   
6. What was the group’s primary economic activity? ____________________________

7. Give one (economic, social or political) defining aspect of this group’s culture.
   
8. How was this group received by others in America? Use 1-10 scale with 10 being the well-received. Give one explanation for this.
   
9. Give one example of the group’s impact/legacy on American history and/or contemporary culture.

10. How would you generally evaluate this group’s experience during this time period in American history? Use 1-10 scale, with 10 being the most positive.
   
11. Identify two famous people who consider their heritage linked to this group (Identify a contribution of each person).

12. In one sentence, tell what this group’s experience demonstrates about the topic of diversity and tolerance during the American Colonial Period?

Bibliography
Cultural Diversity: To Do Checklist

Student Group # _______ Students in Group: ________________________________

Assigned Immigrant Group: ________________________________
Selected Immigrant Group: ________________________________
Approved: ______
Student Chair: ____________________________________________

Select a Chair and write the name above.

Select one additional group other than the already assigned six from their “Cultural Diversity during the American Cultural Period” lists. Teacher must approve selection. This will be done on a first-come first-serve basis. Write name of group selected above.

Each student is assigned at least ONE question on the CDICA worksheet and is responsible for obtaining that information for both Immigrant Groups

Students assigned to questions for Immigrant Group #1 and #2 and write names here:
Q1: Q5: Q9:
Q2: Q6: Q10:
Q3: Q7: Q11:
Q4: Q8: Q12:

Chair reminds students that:
• They are required to provide a bibliography identifying the sources of their information, i.e. the answers to their assigned questions.
• The time period for reference is mid-18th Century, PRE-American Revolution, 1750-1775
• Answers to the assigned questions should be as specific as possible; however, in some cases, the information may need to be more general.
• This homework assignment is due: ________________________________

Chair submits completed To Do Checklist to teacher at end of class period.
Cultural Diversity during the American Colonial Period

1. Africans
   Mandingo (Mandinka)
   Hausa
   Igbo (Ebo)
   Fulbe Muslims
   Dogon
   Kru
   Akan

2. American Indians
   **Algonquin**
   Huron
   **Iroquois** Seneca, Oneida, Onondaga, Cayuga, Mohawk
   Mohican
   Munsees

3. Europeans
   Jews
   Scots
   Welsh
   Irish
   **French Protestants Huguenots.**
   Germans
   **Dutch, Netherlands.**
   Quakers.
   Catholics
   Puritans (Pilgrims)
   Scotch-Irish.
   Swedes
   Swiss
   **English**
   Spanish

4. OTHER
CULTURAL DIVERSITY IN COLONIAL AMERICA

Name of Group: Dutch

1. What was the PRIMARY reason that the group came to America?
The Dutch initially came to become richer by receiving huge land grants (Patroonships) for bringing settlers to America and engaging in lucrative fur trading.

2. Approximately, how many came before and/or during the American Colonial Period? Approximately 10,000 came. Only about half were ethnically Dutch, others were Walloons and Huguenots.

3. Around 1750-1775, approximately what percentage of the population did this group constitute in America? In 1770, approximately 4% of the population was Dutch; in 1775 approximately 3% was Dutch.

4. Where did they primarily live? The Dutch lived primarily in NY, NYC and in the Hudson River Valley.

5. To what degree, was this group INCLUDED in the American Colonial Society? What demonstrates this and what one explanation for it? The Dutch generally seemed included in society as several families were wealthy and thus powerful. The Dutch had a strong influence on the culture in terms of such aspects as language, religion and leisure activities.

6. What was their primary economic activity? The Dutch were heavily involved in trade. The Dutch West India Company developed the fur trade. Outposts established on the Hudson, Mohawk, Delaware and Connecticut rivers were trade centers with the Native Americans. Fort Orange (Albany) was a major trading center and of course New Amsterdam (NYC) was a major commercial center.

7. Give one defining aspect of this group’s culture. Explain. The Dutch encouraged many other groups to settle in their communalities and generally were accepting of the resulting diversity. Thus, the Dutch contributed to the cosmopolitan nature of American society and to some degree promoted tolerance and appreciation for such diversity. Holland was prosperous and thus few Dutch wanted to leave to settle in America. In America, the Dutch settlement was a “melting pot” or mosaic of many different cultures.

8. To what degree did this group assimilate into the dominant culture? Explain. The Dutch assimilated into the dominant culture and played a role in its creation. The Dutch completely assimilated into the culture in NYC; in the Hudson River Valley, much of the Dutch culture persisted: architecture, foods, religion and language. Example: Sojourner Truth, born a slave in Ulster County, spoke only Dutch until she was eleven years old in 1808 and President Teddy Roosevelt’s Parents spoke Dutch in the home well into the 20th century. Ranking is open-ended.

9. Give one example of the group’s impact or legacy on American history and contemporary culture. Large Hudson River Valley Estates still exist today. The Dutch (Peter Minuit) purchased Manhattan from the American Indians. Other cultural contributions: Santa Claus, pancakes, cole slaw, multiculturalism, and social mobility.
11. How would you generally characterize this group’s experience during this time period in American history?

The Dutch generally seemed to have had a positive and lucrative but brief experience in Colonial America. However, it was one that seems to have had a profound influence on our history and culture.

12. What does this group’s experience demonstrate about the topic of diversity and tolerance during the American Colonial Period?

The Dutch contributed to America’s diversity and seemed to be relatively open to and tolerant of diversity. However, the Dutch were major slavers and owned slaves. The Dutch West India Company was a major slave owner. Also, while the Dutch had some good relations with some American Indians primarily for economic (fur trading) benefits, they also had some brutal confrontations with some Indian tribes. The Dutch contributed to both positive and negative relationships between European and Indians and among the various Indian tribes themselves.

13. Identify five famous people who consider their heritage linked to this group (identify a contribution of each person).

Eleanor and Franklin Roosevelt (American politics and government), Thomas Edison (inventor), Meryl Streep (actress), Martin Van Buren (President), Walt Whitman (poet), Walter Cronkite (TV Newscaster), George W. Bush (President), Theodore Roosevelt (President).

Relevant Notes from Firth Fabend presentation about Dutch legacy:

1. Vocabulary
2. Foods—pancakes, stew
3. Legal principles regarding:
   - Inheritance
   - Real Estate
4. Diversity attitudes (18 languages/dialects)
   - Freedom of Conscience
   - Civic Concord
5. Entrepreneurship
   - Economic justice
6. Societal institutions—education, prisons, banks
7. Land distribution
8. Sports
9. Products: soaps, linens
10. Social structure—same as Holland
    - Artisans; tradesmen; poor supported by Church, private charities and the community
11. Major slaver (along with Britain)
SESSION 2: Jigsaw: How Diverse is America?

Concepts to be covered in this lesson:

• Identify various cultural groups in Colonial America. Use specific information to substantiate a long history of diversity in America.
• Identify essential information about various cultural groups in Colonial America including: why the group came, where the group settled, the contributions of the group, its legacy, and so on.
• Draw and support conclusions about similarities and differences between the various cultural groups and their experiences in Colonial America.
• Using own words, explain the concept of assimilation and the varying degrees to which various cultural groups in Colonial America assimilated. Similarly explain the varying degrees of tolerance exhibited by the different cultural groups. Provide specific examples. Explain some of the primary reasons for these differences.

Opening: How diverse a society is America today? How much diversity do you experience in your life? How do you experience this diversity? Does diversity have value? Explain. Are there challenges to living in a diverse society? What do you think that the historian, Willem Frijhoff, means when asserting that a diverse society may have an “unstable pluralism”? What do you do to promote the experience and the valuing of diversity? What can one do? Have you ever been witness to a negative response to diversity? How did you handle the situation? How should or can one respond in such a situation?

Core Instructional Activities:
1. Teacher distributes two copies of Cultural Diversity in Colonial America Worksheet to each student. Teacher informs students that they will meet in their ORIGINAL groups to obtain the requested information about their two immigration groups from each other. Each group will also discuss the question: What does the group’s experience reveal about diversity and tolerance in colonial America? Teacher explains process of consensus, as opposed to voting: the requirement that everyone must live with a decision of the group. Teacher monitors, assists and checks for accuracy.
2. Teacher reconvenes class and distributes blank copies of the Cultural Diversity in America 1750-1775 CHART (below). As an assessment, students will complete the Chart in terms of the Dutch in Colonial America. Review for accuracy.
3. For the other cultural groups, students who answered the same individual questions will meet with “experts” who answered the same question. Students will share and compare information. Expert groups will then share their information so that everyone in the class can fill out their charts. *OPTIONAL: Class fills in an enlarged version of the chart on smart board or large paper. Talk about what students notice: In what ways is modern America similar and different to this chart?
4. Return to the jigsaw group question: What does each group’s experience reveal about diversity and tolerance in colonial America?

Closure: Which of the following quotes is your favorite? Explain.
1. Civilizations should be measured by the degree of diversity attained and the degree of unity retained. W.H. Auden (Anglo-American Poet)

2. Human diversity makes tolerance more than a virtue; it makes it a requirement for survival. Rene Dubos (French-American Scientist)

3. Diversity is not about how we differ. Diversity is about embracing one another’s uniqueness. Ola Joseph (Nigerian-American Author)
Cultural Diversity in Colonial America 1750-1775

Your Name:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group for Coming</th>
<th>Reason for Coming</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percentage of population</th>
<th>Inclusion/assimilation</th>
<th>Economic Activity</th>
<th>Cultural Characteristic</th>
<th>Reception</th>
<th>Legacy</th>
<th>Experience</th>
<th>Famous People</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Hypothesize:
What does the group’s experience in America demonstrate about diversity and tolerance during the American Colonial Period?

Group:

Hypothesis:

Evidence:

Bibliography:
SESSION 3: Poetry Reading: Who Is An Immigrant?

Concept to be covered in this lesson:
• Define immigrant and identify arguments for and against considering enslaved Africans as immigrants.

Opening: Is everyone in America a descendent of immigrants? Ask students to write their responses on one side of a half sheet of paper. The response should be an answer that includes two or three sentences of explanation. Students should be directed to put their responses away for later use in the lesson. Then discuss: Who are YOU?

Core Instructional Activities
1. Teacher asks students to write their independent definitions of an immigrant (Question #6 on Pre-test)
2. Students share their definitions. Teacher lists essential components of the definitions noted by students.
3. Definitions are discussed. Is it possible to have consensus about a definition of immigrant? Is there a class definition for “immigrant?” Compare class definition with Merriam-Webster definition:
Main Entry: im·mi·grant Pronunciation: \i-mə-grənt\ Function: noun Date: 1789
Definition: one that immigrates: as a: a person who comes to a country to take up permanent residence (http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/immigrants)

4. Distribute copies of Walt Whitman poem and worksheet:

You, whoever you are!...
All you continentals of Asia, Africa, Europe, Australia, indifferent of place!
All you on the numberless islands of the archipelagoes of the sea!
All you of centuries hence when you listen to me!
All you each and everywhere whom I specify not, but include just the same!
Health to you! good will to you all, from me and America sent!
Each of us is inevitable,
Each of us is limitless—each of us with his or her right upon the earth,
Each of us allow’d the eternal purports of the earth,
Each of us here as divinely as any is here.

Walt Whitman
(http://www.loc.gov/wiseguide/mar04/us.html)

Information about Walt Whitman:
http://www.english.illinois.edu/Maps/poets/s_z/whitman/bio.htm
5. Share and discuss answers to the Who is an Immigrant Worksheet: Are the following groups immigrants? Ask students to explain their answers.
   - Indentured Servants
   - Enslaved Africans
   - Ex-Prisoners from other countries
   - American Indians

Clarify: Are you an immigrant if to some degree you are taken against your will to a new place? Are you an immigrant if you do not plan or want to live there permanently?

Ask students to refer back to their initial definitions of immigrants. Is there a change in their personal definitions? Is there a need to change the class’s definition of an immigrant? Is there consensus for a new class definition for immigrant?

**Closure:** Ask students to take out their half sheets of paper. Would they answer the question the same now at the end of this lesson or would their responses be different? On the reverse side of this paper, explain. Sign and submit this paper as an Exit Slip.

**Relevant Content for Teachers**

**Indentured Servants:** In the colonies, there was plenty of land for wealthy landowners, but always a lack of labor. One answer to this problem was to import indentured servants. A landowner would pay the price of passage for an indentured servant and that passenger would work to pay off the cost of his voyage, usually for seven years. Often, the landowner would be given 50 acres for each person he paid to transport. Most of these indentured servants were young, unmarried men, who often had been in service in England. Both the poor and the middle class immigrated as indentured servants. These indentured servants were the primary migrant to the British settlements of Virginia, Maryland, the Carolinas, Jamaica and Barbados. However, the death rate was very high in these colonies as many servants died before they were "acclimatized" to the region. This kept the demand for labor high.

*From: Colonial Immigration: An Overview January, 2000 Jeannine Dugan*

**Ex-Prisoners:** The British government tried to relieve overcrowded prisons by sending "pardoned" prisoners to the colonies for a certain period of time.
Who Is an Immigrant Worksheet

Name:

Date:

1. Based on this poem, describe Whitman’s attitude about immigration and immigrants in America. Explain your response.

2. Using the information in the poem, how might have Whitman defended his opinion about immigrants and immigration; using your own words, give one of his possible arguments.

3. Do you agree or disagree with Whitman’s opinion? Explain.

4. If Walt Whitman were to be our guest speaker on the topic of immigration, what is one question you would ask him during the question and answer session?

5. Show your neighbor the question in your #4; ask him/her to answer it as if s/he were Walt Whitman.

6. Today, in America, is it considered a good or bad thing to be an Immigrant? Give an example to substantiate your opinion.
SESSION 4: Is the Enslaved African an Immigrant?

Concept to be covered in this lesson:
- Define immigrant and identify arguments for and against considering enslaved Africans as immigrants.

Opening: Is being considered an Immigrant a good or bad thing?

Core Instructional Activities: Before watching the Joyce Goodfriend video presentation about this topic, teacher will determine what students think about the aim question. Ask students to stand in the area in the classroom representing three positions (teacher directs students to different spots); For, Against, or Not Sure that enslaved Africans should be classified as an immigrant group. Once they are in position, ask students in each group to share reasons for their position.

Class discussion ensues with a focus on reasons in support and in opposition. Create lists of arguments in support of and in opposition to the question. Also, create list about how enslaved Africans are similar and different from other immigrant groups. Examples might include:

Similarities with Other Immigrant Groups:
- followers of Christianity
- brought culture: behavior, values, attitudes
- transplanted
- some degree of assimilation
- added to diversity
- from different places and cultures

Differences from Other Immigrant Groups
- rarely came as families (but recreated families here through baptism, marriage)
- forced to come
- disrespected as people
- seen as Blacks or Africans—not from a particular country or culture but rather given a racial/color category
- generally excluded, with no opportunities for social mobility

Following discussion, ask the question again: Should Enslaved Africans be classified as an Immigrant Group? Tally results to determine if the discussion has resulted in changed opinions. If there are changed minds, ask what arguments were most persuasive.

Video: Distribute wroksheet (below) for Joyce Goodfriend’s video presentation. Students watch the video and complete the worksheet. After watching the video, are there new arguments to add to the chart? Are there additional points to be made regarding the similarities and differences between Africans and other groups living in America during the Colonial Period? How does the question of similarities and differences impact the
larger question of whether or not enslaved Africans should be considered Immigrants? What are the advantages and disadvantages of Blacks being considered immigrants during the American Colonial Period? Additional questions to challenge student answers:

- Would the achievements of Blacks be ignored or diminished if they are not considered immigrants?
- If there is some value and truth to America being the land of many peoples, then isn’t it necessary to include enslaved Africans as immigrants?
- Does including them as immigrants diminish the fact that they were brought to America against their will and in chains?
- Does the reality of their segregation/exclusion/marginalization in society lose significance if they are viewed as an immigrant group?

Closure: Once an adequate list of different arguments has been established and clarified, ask students to rank order each group of reasons. Exit slip: Should enslaved Africans be considered immigrants? Give your major argument to support your opinion.

Relevant Content for Teachers

Goodfriend’s resources included Passenger Lists and her talk focuses on the relationship between the Dutch and enslaved Africans.

According to her, in 1664, the Dutch West India Company brought slaves that were sold at auction. Nameless Africans but names of purchasers and prices paid are identified. The Dutch Reformed Church refused to admit Africans as members.

Differences between Enslaved Africans and other groups:
- People not commodities…inequity.
- Blacks not Africans diverse regional origins
- Immigrants voyagers not slaves experiencing the horrific Middle Passage
- Involuntary not a choice to come to America
- Came not part of family unit

Similarities between Enslaved Africans and other groups
- Shared culture. Christianity.
- Important component to diversity of Colonial America
- Recreated families…baptism and marriage
- Adopted Dutch cultural institutions
- Also brought West/Central African cultures
- Everyone is child of immigrants
Joyce Goodfriend Presentation:
Should Enslaved Africans be Considered Immigrants?

Name:
Date:

1. What is Goodfriend’s opinion regarding the question: Should enslaved Africans be considered immigrants? According to her, what role does racism play in opinions about this question?

2. What are two arguments that she presents to support her position? What is your evaluation of these two arguments? How convincing is each argument?
   A. 
   B. 

3. What is your opinion regarding the question? Provide one reason to support this position.

4. What are two pieces of information about the relationship between the Dutch and Enslaved Africans that you learn from Goodfriend’s presentation?
   A. 
   B. 

5. Goodfriend focuses on some of the differences and similarities between Enslaved Africans and other groups who came to Colonial America. Identify two of those differences and two of the similarities that she mentions.
   A. 
   B. 
   C. 
   D. 

6. How do these similarities and differences seem to influence Goodfriend’s opinion on the basic question? How does it influence your opinion on the question?
7. According to the presentation, what are one advantage and one disadvantage of including Enslaved Africans as a group of immigrants?

   A. 

   B. 

8. Was information provided in the presentation that had NOT been discussed earlier in the class discussion? If yes, identify an important piece of information that was learned from the presentation.

9. Explain the influence of this presentation on your opinion about the inclusion of Enslaved Africans as immigrants.

10. If you had the opportunity to ask Joyce Goodfriend a question about this topic, what would you ask?
SESSION 5: Debate: Should Enslaved Africans be considered immigrants?

Concept to be covered in this lesson:
- Define immigrant and articulate arguments for and against considering enslaved Africans as immigrants.

Opening: Announce: “Today, we will draw from Goodfriend and our discussion yesterday to answer this historical question: Should enslaved Africans be considered immigrants?” Based on the responses in the previous class’s Exit Slips, teacher either assigns a position or allows students to choose their position on the debate topic. Teacher may function as the judge or invite others for that responsibility.

Core Activity:
1. Teacher distributes an Assessment Rubric (websites below) and reviews it, noting that students will assess the Opposing team and the teacher will assess both teams.

Sample Assessment Rubrics for informal debate are available at
http://csdept.smumn.edu/assessment/docs/debateRubic.pdf
http://mh034.k12.sd.us/classroom_debate_rubric.htm
http://myweb.lmu.edu/tshanahan/nt-debatescoring.html
http://www.greece.k12.ny.us/instruction/ela/6-12/Rubrics/Debate%20Rubric.doc

2. Teacher explains basic rules of the debate, such as:
   - Civility is a must. Respect and be supportive of peers.
   - Listen attentively, no distractions
   - Speak only when recognized by the moderator. Raise hand for permission to speak
   - Allow others to express their opinions; do not monopolize
   - Use grammatically correct and appropriate language.
   - Speak clearly, slowly, energetically and loud enough to be heard

3. Teacher outlines Debate Process
   - Each team makes opening statement, outlining main points
   - Affirmative Team starts (Maximum 4 minutes each)
   - Affirmative team elaborates on first point. (Maximum two minutes)
   - Opposing team refutes. (Maximum two minutes)
   - Affirmative team responds and back and forth discussion ensues.
   - Each speaker must raise hand to be recognized before speaking.
   - Teacher will decide when to move the debate forward by giving the opposing team the opportunity to make its first point.
   - The process continues repeatedly until the time comes for Closing Statements.
   - Optional: Permit students to raise hands for points of information (clarification needed) or order (perceived violations of process).
4. Teacher permits teams to meet briefly to organize. In groups, students should complete To Do Checklist for the debate and submit it to the teacher.

5. Debate ensues. Following the Debate, assessments are completed and submitted to the teacher.

**Closure:** Who won the debate? Why? Teacher or judge(s) announce the “winner” of the debate and identify the primary reasons. Return to the Unit EQ: Did diversity in this case lead to tolerance or intolerance?
TO DO CHECKLIST FOR THE DEBATE

DEBATE TOPIC: Should enslaved Africans be considered immigrants?

TEAM POSITION:

Checklist:

_____ Review assessment and debate rules. Underline the need for full participation.

_____ Identify student to deliver opening statement identifying main points.
   Name:

_____ List Main Points:

_____ Identify opposing team’s probable main points and possible rebuttals for each:

_____ Identify student to deliver closing statement summarizing main points.
   Name:
Relevant Content for Teachers

Arguments for enslaved Africans as immigrants:

- Definition of an immigrant—change in residence, crossing an international boundary. Enslaved African satisfies this definition.
- Shared important similarities with other immigrant groups. E.g. experienced hostility; challenge of adapting to a different culture and environment; struggle to retain and preserve heritage, history and culture, and so on. Other immigrant groups were marginalized or excluded, including American Indians. Blacks did assimilate to some degree into the dominant culture. E.g. some adopted Dutch institutions and culture. Dutch Reformed Church excluded Blacks but Christianity is a shared characteristic and shared culture.
- Should not be excluded from the study and discussion of early immigration to America. In the first census in 1790, Africans represented 19% of the Non-Indian population. Not all Africans were enslaved, nor did all enslaved Africans remain enslaved. To only study Africans in America when looking at the institution of slavery restricts the knowledge that should be learned.
- Important component to the reality of diversity in Colonial America. America traditionally is viewed as “A Nation of Immigrants.” Africans should not be excluded from this positive perception of America and her history. Africans deserve a place at that table. Important advantages to inclusion.
- Including Enslaved Africans as an immigrant group supports the understanding of and appreciation for the legacy of the African culture in contemporary America. Historical and current forms of worship, family organization, music, food, art, and language reflect African traditional cultures. In some areas, such as South Carolina and Florida, several different West African languages contributed to the formation of continuing dialects.
- Other immigrants were forced to varying degrees to come to America such as prisoners, indentured servants…forced migration or immigration should not prevent enslaved Africans from being viewed as immigrants, according to Lolita Buckner Inniss (Trick Magic: Blacks as Immigrants and the Paradox of Forgiveness, 1999). General failure of assimilation—continued exclusion. Blacks are a de-facto immigrant class (Rhonda V. Magee—Professor of Law at University of San Francisco) as part of a state sponsored immigration system.
- In the end EVERYONE is a child of immigrants. Common bond.
- Must be considered an immigrant group to support the Federal government’s Constitutional authority to regulate immigration rooted in the slave trade provision in the Original Constitution.
- In 1988, Jesse Jackson decided to publicly urge Americans to use the term—African-Americans when referring to blacks. The reason for this was to provide a connection to a place and something of an ethnic identity for black Americans akin to what most blacks believed was the case for most whites.
- Not the stereotypical immigrant but an immigrant nonetheless. Morally and historically wrong to ignore or omit Blacks.
- Inclusion provides ethnic solidarity, identity, group-worth.
- Recreated families (baptism, marriage…) despite their coming as individuals
- Goodfriend claims: exclusion is an artificial cleavage, based on racism.
Arguments against enslaved Africans as immigrants:

- Definition of an immigrant—Webster’s defines "immigrate" as: "to go or remove into a new country, region, or environment in order to settle there." Webster’s defines "emigrate" as: "to leave one country, state, or region and settle in another, for the purpose of residence." Enslaved Africans did not come to settle. The key words here are "in order to settle" and "for the purpose of residence." Migration involves the conscious, willful agency of the migrant. Immigration or emigration is conceived and executed by the human migrant, according to Paul Street (pstreet@niu.edu), historian, writer, speaker, and activist.
- Enslaved Africans came to America in chains against their will.
- Enslaved Africans were virtually excluded from interaction in society/living outside, marginalized and/or segregated from the dominant culture.
- Enslaved Africans had no opportunity for social mobility. Victims of prejudice and discrimination reinforced by state and federal laws, policies and practices. Slave Codes: no intermarriage, no freedom of movement, no education.
- Their humanity was denied. Considered property not human beings. Perpetuity of enslavement.
- Viewed and considered a racial group not as a group from a particular country or culture. African is a misleading cultural identity as the enslaved Africans were from diverse regions and cultures. Debating who qualifies as an “African American” misses the deeper point. J. A. Foster-Bey argues the term "African American" should not be applied to black immigrants. But Africa is not a country. There is no African ethnicity, or one African language, or African culture. Africa, like Europe and Asia, is a continent and home to a multitude of countries, cultures, languages, social systems, and ethnic groups. To be called an African-American — or an African, for that matter — is to provide little real insight into who you are, where you come from, or what you believe and value.
- Immigrants were voyagers not captives experiencing the horrific Middle Passage
- Came as individuals not as families
- Some believe that associating enslaved Africans with immigrants diminishes the tragedy and horror of the slave trade and the institution of slavery.

http://memory.loc.gov/learn//features/immig/alt/african2.html